



# 69<sup>th</sup> ANNUAL SESSION

## 6-9 OCTOBER 2023

### COMMITTEE ON DEMOCRACY AND SECURITY (CDS) MEETING SUMMARY AND ATTENDANCE LIST

7 – 8 October 2023  
CONFERENCE ROOM D2

BELLA CENTER  
COPENHAGEN, DANEMARK

I. **Opening remarks by Ante BACIC (HR), Acting Chairperson of the Committee on Democracy and Security**

1. The acting Chairperson thanked the Danish delegation for hosting this session.

II. **Adoption of the draft agenda [138 CDS 23 E]**

2. **The draft agenda was adopted [138 CDS 23 E].**

III. **Adoption of the [Summary](#) of the previous Committee meeting [100 CDS 23 E]**

3. **The Summary [100 CDS 23 E] was adopted.**

IV. **Consideration of the Revised Draft Special Report [Food Security and Conflict: Harvesting Resilience in the Face of a Global Crisis](#) [016 CDS 23 E rev. 1], presented by Julie DZEROWICZ (Canada), Special Rapporteur**

4. Ms Dzerowicz (CA) emphasised that the world is facing an unprecedented food crisis. While many interdependent factors are at the root of this situation, conflict is by far the main cause of food insecurity worldwide. Nowhere is this more evident today than in Ukraine, where Russia's deliberate attacks on critical food infrastructure and weaponisation of Ukrainian food exports have exacerbated global hunger. In the face of the worsening crisis, she called on Allies to strengthen national and global resilience to food insecurity and its destabilising effects by increasing the resistance of their own food systems and supply chains; mobilising additional resources to support Ukraine's food security needs; supporting humanitarian and development efforts in countries most affected by the crisis; and continuing to denounce Russia's weaponisation of food and its effects on global food levels.

5. Addressing a question from **Rodrigue Demeuse** (BE) about how to counter Russian disinformation on food insecurity, particularly in Africa, Ms Dzerowicz (CA) emphasised the need for more direct communication with international audiences. Rodrigue Demeuse and **Merle Spellerberg** (DE) inquired about the impact of growing water scarcity and climate change on food security. Recalling NATO's 2022 Strategic Concept, Ms Dzerowicz said that addressing these interrelated challenges was crucial for Allied resilience. **Joe Wilson** (US) stressed the importance of basing decisions relating to climate change on facts. **Andrés Ingi Jónsson** (IS) and Merle Spellerberg (DE) pointed out that many developing countries were already experiencing a climate crisis. Andrés Ingi Jónsson also raised the issue of environmental destruction in Ukraine and noted the gendered impact of food insecurity. Responding to **Bart Kroon** (NL) on how to make agricultural policies more sustainable and resilient, Ms Dzerowicz shared some good practices from Canada. **Matteo Richetti** (IT) said that all belligerents in Ukraine should comply with international law. **Urmas Reinsalu** (EE) said that Allies need to keep a unified stance and prevent Russia from instrumentalising grain supplies. **Roman Hryshchuk** (UA) expressed his gratitude towards the Special Rapporteur for mentioning the Holodomor in her report and encouraged the Danish parliament to recognise it as a genocide. Responding to question from **Ante Bacic** (HR) about growing food prices in Europe, Ms Dzerowicz emphasised the need for both national and collective measures.

6. **The draft report [016 CDS 23 E rev. 1] was adopted.**

**V. Presentation on *Bolstering Human Security in the Face of the Climate Change Crisis* by Dan JØRGENSEN, Minister for Development Cooperation and Minister for Global Climate Policy**

7. Mr Jørgensen highlighted that climate change, by aggravating pre-existing issues, constitutes a major driver of conflict. NATO, as an international platform, has a role to play in addressing this threat to international security. Mr Jørgensen urged members to acknowledge and act upon the fact that all countries in the world, particularly developing countries, are already being affected by climate change. Arguing for a more holistic approach, Mr Jørgensen called upon Allies to go beyond existing decarbonisation efforts. He stressed the need to facilitate the green transition and create conditions for resilience and adaptation in vulnerable countries. To that effect, Allies should create incentives for more investments in key sectors of their economies and mobilise 0.7% of their GNI for developmental aid, as recommended by the United Nations.

8. Responding to a question from Merle Spellerberg (DE) on ways to address disinformation relating to climate change, Mr Jørgensen insisted on the need to stand by democratic values and support civic empowerment. Andrés Ingi Jónsson (IS) highlighted the responsibility of the largest fossil fuel exploration countries in reducing fossil fuel emissions. Responding to questions by Rodrigue Demeuse (BE) and **Grozdan Karadjov** (BG) on the green transition in developing countries, Mr Jørgensen emphasised the need to set the common standards and help developing countries meet them and create new jobs and opportunities. Responding to questions by **Nadège Abomangoli** (FR) and Merle Spellerberg (DE) on climate refugees, Mr Jørgensen reiterated that the priority should be to create circumstances where people do not have to leave their country in the first place. This can be done by improving resilience and adaptation at different levels and addressing the specific needs of vulnerable groups. To that effect, he recommended increasing development aid, improving emergency response mechanisms, and finding innovating ways of financing such efforts. Adding to a comment made by Julie Dzerowicz (CA), Mr Jørgensen emphasised the need for governments to provide incentives for private companies to invest in the green transition in developing countries. To a question from **Aleksandrs Kirsteins** (LV) on climate scepticism, Mr Jørgensen responded that there was a wide scientific consensus on the reality of climate change.

**VI. Presentation on *The Importance of Demining in Humanitarian and Development Assistance* by Charlotte SLENTE, Secretary General of the Danish Refugee Council**

9. Ms Slente explained that mine contamination is a worldwide problem that claims lives daily, destroys livelihoods and undermines economic recovery. She reminded members that the use of such weapons create long-term risks and harm civilians, in violation of international humanitarian law. She provided an overview of the Danish Refugee Council's (DRC) mandate and activities. She emphasised the complexity and cost of mine clearing activities, noting that there has been a steady decline in resources allocated to this task since 2018. Yet, the need for such activities has increased as respect for international norms surrounding the use of explosive ordnances is eroding. Ms Slente called on Allied countries to be more vocal against the use of anti-personnel mines and cluster munitions and to provide additional support to demining, risk education and victim assistance efforts.

10. Responding to Andrés Ingi Jónsson (IS) on victim assistance, Ms Slente emphasised the need for financial and capacity building support from developed countries. Rodrigue Demeuse (BE) said that the use of exploding ordnances by all belligerents in urban contexts in Ukraine should be condemned, highlighted the negative impact of these weapons on food security, and noted that they cause population displacement. Ms Slente acknowledged that displaced people were more at risk of harm by landmines. Responding to Julie Dzerowicz (CA) on using technology to help with demining, Ms Slente stressed that ultimately, human intervention cannot be replaced. Merle Spellerberg (DE) asked about the gendered impact of the use of mines; Ms Slente answered that indeed women, but

more so children, were disproportionately affected by this issue. Responding to Ante Bacic (HR)'s inquiry, Ms Slente said that the DRC had provided assistance to Croatia in the past.

## VII. Summary of Committee and Sub-Committee Activities for 2024

11. The acting Chairperson thanked Romania and Germany for hosting visits in April and September respectively. For its last visit of 2023, the CDSRCS will travel to Sweden in October as part of a Rose-Roth seminar. The acting Chairperson indicated that in 2024 the Committee and the Sub-Committee intend to visit to Albania, Algeria, and Spain. He also noted that the following topics would be addressed in reports: preventing and combatting sexual violence in conflict situations, protecting cultural heritage in times of war, and water security.

## VIII. Consideration of the Revised Draft Report of the Sub-Committee on Resilience and Civil Security [Fighting Impunity for Violations of International Law in Russia's Renewed Invasion of Ukraine](#) [015 CDSRCS 23 E rev.1], presented by Rodrigue DEMEUSE (Belgium), Rapporteur

12. Mr Demeuse (BE) explained that, since 24 February 2022, Russia has systematically violated international law in Ukraine. Some of these breaches constitute war crimes, crimes against humanity, and possibly acts of genocide. Acknowledging the efforts already undertaken, the Rapporteur called on Allies to continue fighting impunity to ensure that perpetrators at all levels are held to account for their crimes. To that effect, Allies should continue to call for the withdrawal of Russian troops while maintaining and reinforcing their political and military support for Ukraine. They should allocate more resources to national and international judicial institutions responsible for collecting evidence and prosecuting violations. Finally, they should continue calling for the creation of an international tribunal for the crime of aggression to prosecute Russian and Belarusian leaders.

13. Andrés Ingi Jónsson (IS) noted that Russia's attacks on the environment in Ukraine and its threat to resume nuclear tests were contributing to the erosion of international norms. He regretted that not every state was a member of the International Criminal Court (ICC); Mr Demeuse said that creating a special international tribunal could help fill the accountability gap without undermining the ICC's work. Mr Demeuse agreed with Joe Wilson (US) on the need for a special tribunal to judge Vladimir Putin for the crime of aggression but said that legal difficulties must first be overcome. **Urmaz Reinsalu** (EE) said that the creation of an international tribunal was primarily a question of political will and that there is solid ground to believe that Russia is carrying out a genocidal war. Mr Demeuse noted that Russia is trying to erase Ukrainian cultural and identity. Responding to **Nicolas Dragon** (FR) on whether a trial *in absentia* could be considered, Mr Demeuse said that trials *in absentia* are not allowed under the Statute of Rome or that of other international tribunals but that fortunately no statutory limitations apply to crimes within the jurisdiction of such tribunals.

14. **The draft report [015 CDSRCS 23 E rev.1] was adopted.**

15. Julie Dzerowicz (CA) took over as acting Chairperson for the remainder of the meeting.

## IX. Consideration of the Revised Draft Report [The Russian War on Truth: Defending Allied and Partner Democracies Against the Kremlin's Disinformation Campaigns](#) [014 CDS 23 E rev.1] presented by Rodrigue DEMEUSE (Belgium), Acting General Rapporteur

16. Mr Demeuse (BE) explained that Russia is waging war both on the battlefield and in the informational space. Russian and Russian-affiliated actors have stepped up their attacks in the context of the renewed invasion of Ukraine. The Acting General Rapporteur praised Ukraine's and Allies' quick and effective response but warned that they must do more to protect their societies from disinformation. Russian disinformation campaigns are a major threat to Allied democracy and

security. They seek to weaken societal cohesion, exacerbate pre-existing fault lines and undermine trust in democratic institutions. Allies should continue to engage in efforts to increase their national and collective resilience against this threat. Mr Demeuse thanked Joëlle Garriaud-Maylam, who had left the Assembly shortly before the session, for her work as General Rapporteur.

17. **The draft report [014 CDS 23 E rev.1] was adopted.**

**X. Presentation on *Disinformation and Emerging Technologies* by Dr Flemming Splidsboel HANSEN, Senior Researcher at the Danish Institute for International Studies**

18. Dr Hansen explained how Russia is using the cyber space to spread disinformation and shape political opinions across the world. In this context, authoritarian actors are currently racing to acquire emerging technologies. The Alliance must maintain its technological edge to be able to defend itself from the threat posed by increasingly sophisticated disinformation tools and software. Strengthening the cognitive resilience of Allied societies is also needed to protect societies from current and future disinformation threats.

19. **Khatia Tsilosani** (GE) and **Javier Maroto** (ES) highlighted the tension between countering disinformation and upholding human rights, with Mr Maroto adding that anonymity was the primary enabler of disinformation on social media. Dr Hansen emphasised the role that the European Union could play in regulating such platforms and suggested banning state-sponsored media on a case-by-case basis. Mr Demeuse stressed the need to strengthen national laws and require greater transparency from social media companies, while at the same time protecting freedom of expression. Responding to Andrés Ingi Jónsson (IS) about the role of social media companies, Mr Demeuse said the criteria used to moderate social media content should be defined democratically. **Ion Spac** (MD) asked about the best way to fight Russian propaganda in Moldova; Dr Hansen and Mr Demeuse suggested building up its cognitive resilience by deepening its collaboration with relevant partners. Responding to Joe Wilson (US) on countering disinformation from and inside closed-up countries, Mr Demeuse evoked the issue of North Korean propaganda. **Tinatin Bokuchava** (GE) explained how Russian propaganda in Georgia seeks to undermine support for the West and highlighted the need to counter disinformation not only from the Kremlin but also from its proxies operating in NATO and aspirant countries; Dr Hansen and Mr Demeuse said greater media literacy is needed to prevent people from spreading disinformation unintentionally. Responding to Julie Dzerowicz's (CA) question on how to get people to believe in the truth, Mr Demeuse emphasised the role that a NATO Centre for Democratic Resilience could play. **Roman Hryshchuk** (UA) stressed the role of the Russian Orthodox Church in spreading disinformation. **Vasile Dincu** (RO) noted the rapidity of Russian disinformation. Merle Spellerberg (DE) said that some societal groups are more vulnerable to disinformation than others.

**XI. Consideration of amendments and vote on the Draft Resolution [159 CDS 23 E] [Protecting Allied and Partner Democracies Against Disinformation](#) by **Rodrigue DEMEUSE** (Belgium), Acting General Rapporteur**

20. Mr Demeuse presented the Draft Resolution and gave an overview of its key recommendations. At the national level, the resolution invites Allies to enhance their capacity to detect and respond to disinformation campaigns. Strengthening their national legal frameworks and supporting media literacy efforts is crucial in that regard. Collectively, the resolution calls on Allies to deepen their collaboration with each other and with relevant international organisations, particularly the European Union. The creation of a Centre for Democratic Resilience inside NATO is also needed. Finally, Allied states should urge social media companies to better regulate their platforms.

21. Nicolas Dragon (FR) noted that fighting against disinformation is first and foremost the competence of sovereign states and that NATO's interventions should be limited to responding to campaigns targeting the Alliance itself.

22. Nine amendments were submitted to the Draft Resolution. Eight amendments were adopted, some with modifications. One amendment was withdrawn.

23. **The draft resolution [159 CDS 23 E] was adopted as amended.**

## **XII. Election of Committee and Sub-Committee Officers**

24. The Acting Chair announced the procedure for election of Committee and Sub-Committee officers. All Committee and Sub-Committee officers eligible for re-election were all re-elected, and the following candidates were elected by acclamation:

### ***Committee on Democracy and Security***

Vice-Chairperson	<b>Javier Maroto (ES)</b>
General Rapporteur	<b>Rodrigue Demeuse (BE)</b>

### ***Sub-Committee on Resilience and Civil Security***

Chairperson	<b>Vasile Dincu (RO)</b>
Vice-Chairpersons	<b>Brett Guthrie (US)</b> <b>Andrés Ingi Jónsson (IS)</b>
Rapporteur	<b>Merle Spellerberg (DE)</b>

### ***Ukraine-NATO Interparliamentary Council (UNIC)***

Members	<b>Aleksandrs Kiršteins (LV)</b> <b>Andrés Ingi Jónsson (IS)</b>
Alternate members	<b>Tomas Jirsa (CZ)</b> <b>Monika Falej (PL)</b>

## **XIII. Closing remarks**

25. The acting Chairperson informed members that the next meeting of the CDS will take place in Bulgaria at the 2023 Spring Session.

26. The acting Chairperson closed the meeting of the Committee on Democracy and Security.

## ATTENDANCE LIST

Acting Chairperson	<b>Ante BACIC</b> (Croatia)
Acting General Rapporteur	<b>Rodrigue DEMEUSE</b> (Belgium)
Special Rapporteur	<b>Julie DZEROWICZ</b> (Canada)
Rapporteur of the Sub-Committee on Resilience and Civil Security (CDSRCS)	<b>Rodrigue DEMEUSE</b> (Belgium)

### MEMBER DELEGATIONS

Albania	<b>Bardhyl KOLLÇAKU</b> <i>(Socialist Party)</i> <b>Bujar LESKAJ</b> <i>(Democratic Party)</i> <b>Xhemal QEFALIA</b> <i>(Socialist Party)</i>
Belgium	<b>Rodrigue DEMEUSE</b> <i>(Ecolo-Groen)</i> <b>Orry VAN DE WAUWER</b> <i>(CDV)</i>
Bulgaria	<b>Grozdan KARADJOV</b> <i>(There is such people)</i>
Canada	<b>Frank CAPUTO</b> <i>(Conservative)</i> <b>Cheryl GALLANT</b> <i>(Conservative)</i>
Croatia	<b>Ante BACIC</b> <i>(Croatian Democratic Union)</i>
Czech Republic	<b>Tomas JIRSA</b> <i>(Civic Democratic Party)</i>
Estonia	<b>Jüri RATAS</b> <i>(Centre Party)</i> <b>Urmas REINSALU</b> <i>(Isamaa)</i>
Finland	<b>Mika Pekka KARI</b> <i>(Social Democratic Party)</i>
France	<b>Nadège ABOMANGOLI</b> <i>(La France insoumise – New Ecological and Social People’s Union (NUPES))</i> <b>Nicolas DRAGON</b> <i>(National Rally)</i>
Germany	<b>Merle SPELLERBERG</b> <i>(The Greens/Alliance '90)</i>
Iceland	<b>Andrés Ingi JÓNSSON</b> <i>(Pirate Party)</i>

Italy	<b>Matteo RICETTI</b> <i>(Azione - Italia Viva - Calenda)</i>
Latvia	<b>Aleksandrs KIRSTEINS</b> <i>(National Alliance)</i>
Lithuania	<b>Dainius GAIZAUSKAS</b> <i>(Lithuanian Farmers and Greens Union)</i>
Netherlands	<b>Bart KROON</b> <i>(Farmer Citizen Movement (BBB))</i>
Norway	<b>Bengt FASTERAUNE</b> <i>(Centre Party)</i> <b>Tellef Inge MORLAND</b> <i>(Labour Party)</i>
Poland	<b>Paweł ARNDT</b> <i>(Civic Coalition)</i> <b>Monika FALEJ</b> <i>(Left)</i>
Portugal	<b>Joana Sa PEREIRA</b> <i>(Socialist Party)</i>
Romania	<b>Vasile DINCU</b> <i>(Social Democratic Party)</i>
Spain	<b>Javier ANTON</b> <i>(Socialist Party)</i> <b>Guillermo MARISCAL</b> <i>(People's Party)</i> <b>Javier MAROTO</b> <i>(People's Party)</i> <b>Carlos ROJAS</b> <i>(People's Party)</i>
Türkiye	<b>Fethi ACIKEL</b> <i>(Republican People's Party)</i> <b>Tugba ISIK ERCAN</b> <i>(Justice and Development Party)</i> <b>Oguz UCUNCU</b> <i>(Justice and Development Party)</i>
United States	<b>Joe WILSON</b> <i>(Republican)</i>
<b>ASSOCIATE DELEGATIONS</b>	
Austria	<b>Hubert FUCHS</b> <i>(Freedom Party)</i> <b>David STÖGMÜLLER</b> <i>(The Greens)</i>
Azerbaijan	<b>Kamran BAYRAMOV</b> <i>(New Azerbaijan Party)</i>
Georgia	<b>Tinatin BOKUCHAVA</b> <i>(Block, United National Movement - United Opposition, Strength in Unity)</i>



Republic of Moldova	<b>Khatia TSILOSANI</b> <i>(Georgian Dream - Democratic Georgia)</i>
Serbia	<b>Ion SPAC</b> <i>(Party of Action and Solidarity (PAS))</i> <b>Natasa JOVANOVIĆ</b> <i>(Aleksandar Vucic - together we can do anything)</i> <b>Ugljesa MRDIĆ</b> <i>(Aleksandar Vucic - together we can do anything)</i> <b>Dejan RADENKOVIĆ</b> <i>(Ivica Dacic - Socialist Party of Serbia)</i>
Ukraine	<b>Roman HRYSHCHUK</b> <i>(Servant of the People)</i>

**REGIONAL PARTNERS AND MEDITERRANEAN ASSOCIATES**

Algeria	<b>Ayoub HAMDAD</b> <i>(Independents)</i>
Jordan	<b>Hussein MAJALI</b>
Morocco	<b>Saber EL KIAF</b> <i>(National Rally of Independents (RNI))</i> <b>Salek EL MOUSSAOUI</b> <i>(Socialist Party)</i>

**PARLIAMENTARY OBSERVERS**

Assembly of Kosovo	<b>Xhavit HALITI</b> <i>(Democratic Party of Kosovo (PDK))</i>
Australia	<b>Luke GOSLING</b> <i>(Labor Party)</i>

**SPEAKERS**

	<b>Flemming Splidsboel HANSEN</b> Senior Researcher, Danish Institute for International Studies
	<b>Dan JØRGENSEN</b> Minister for Development Cooperation and Minister for Global Climate Policy
	<b>Charlotte SLENTE</b> Secretary General of the Danish Refugee Council

**INTERNATIONAL SECRETARIAT**

Nathan GRISON	Director, CDS
Jailee RYCHEN	Coordinator, CDS
Anaïs FIAULT	Researcher