



NATO PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY

# MINUTES

OF THE PLENARY SITTING OF THE

## SIXTY-FOURTH ANNUAL SESSION

*Halifax Convention Centre  
Halifax, Canada*

Monday 19 November 2018

235 SESA 18 E | Original: English

## 1. Opening of the Sitting

The 64th Annual Session was opened at 9:00 on Monday 19 November 2018, with **Rasa Jukneviene (Lithuania)**, President of the NATO Parliamentary Assembly, in the Chair.

The President declared the 64th Annual Session of the NATO Parliamentary Assembly open and welcomed participants.

## 2. Indigenous blessing

The President invited **Borys Wrzesnewskyj**, Head of the Canadian delegation, to introduce **Elder Marlene Companion**.

**Borys Wrzesnewskyj** (Canada) introduced Elder Marlene Companion.

**Elder Marlene Companion** then performed an indigenous blessing.

## 3. Address by **Rasa Jukneviene (Lithuania)**, President of the NATO Parliamentary Assembly

The President addressed the Assembly.

## 4. Address by **The Honourable Harjit Singh Sajjan**, Minister for National Defence of Canada, followed by a question and answer period

The President welcomed the Minister.

The Honourable **Harjit Singh Sajjan** addressed the Assembly and answered questions from **Cheryl Gallant** (Canada), **Lord Campbell of Pittenweem** (United Kingdom) and **Ivans Klementjevs** (Latvia).

The President thanked The Honourable Harjit Singh Sajjan.

## 5. Address by **Rose Gottemoeller**, Deputy Secretary General of NATO, followed by a question and answer period

The President welcomed **Rose Gottemoeller**, Deputy Secretary General of NATO.

**Rose Gottemoeller** addressed the Assembly and answered questions from **Philippe Folliot** (France), **Julio Miranda Calha** (Portugal), **Lord Jopling** (United Kingdom), **Ricardo Tarno** (Spain), **Christian Tybring-Gjedde** (Norway), **Liv Signe Navarsete** (Norway), **Njall Trausti Fridbertsson** (Iceland), **Andreas Loverdos** (Greece), **Juozas Olekas** (Lithuania), **Brigitte Grouwels** (Belgium), **Jane Cordy** (Canada), **Jürgen Hardt** (Germany), **David McAllister** (European Parliament), **Koryun Nahapetyan** (Armenia), **Sofio Katsarava** (Georgia), **Iryna Friz** (Ukraine), **Gerald Connolly** (United States), **Vesel Memedi** (Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia<sup>1</sup>), **Richard Benyon** (United Kingdom), **Cheryl Gallant** (Canada), **Giorgi Kandelaki** (Georgia) and **Franklin van Kappen** (Netherlands).

The President thanked Rose Gottemoeller.

<sup>1</sup> Turkey recognises Macedonia under its constitutional name.

The sitting was suspended between 11.40 and 12.00.

**6. Address by H.E. Mr Talat Xhaferi, MDS, President of the Assembly of the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia, followed by a question and answer period**

The President welcomed **Talat Xhaferi, President of the Assembly of the Former Yugoslav Republic of Macedonia.**

**Talat Xhaferi** addressed the Assembly and answered questions from **Zsolt Nemeth** (Hungary), **Julio Miranda Calha** (Portugal) and **Christos Karagiannidis** (Greece).

The President thanked Talat Xhaferi.

**7. Presentation by Marc Angel, Treasurer of the Assembly, and vote on the *Draft budget for the Financial Year 2019* [099 FIN 18 E rev. 1 bis]**

The Treasurer presented the draft Budget.

The draft Budget of the Assembly for the Financial Year 2019 [099 FIN 18 E rev. 1 bis] was adopted.

The President thanked Marc Angel.

**8. Election of the President and the five Vice-presidents of the Assembly**

There being only one nomination for the post of President of the Assembly, **Madeleine Moon (United Kingdom) was elected by acclamation.**

The President congratulated **Madeleine Moon** (United Kingdom) on her election.

**Madeleine Moon** (United Kingdom) addressed the Assembly.

The President thanked Madeleine Moon.

The President thanked the outgoing Vice-presidents for their contributions to the work of the Assembly.

There being five nominations for the positions of Vice-president, **Osman Askin Bak** (Turkey), **Richard Benyon** (United Kingdom), **Michael R. Turner** (United States) and **Franklin van Kappen** (Netherlands) were elected by acclamation. **Vitalino Canas** (Portugal) was re-elected by acclamation.

The President congratulated **Osman Askin Bak** (Turkey), **Richard Benyon** (United Kingdom), **Michael R. Turner** (United States) and **Franklin van Kappen** (Netherlands) on their election, and congratulated **Vitalino Canas** (Portugal) on his re-election.

9. **Presentation by Joseph A. Day on behalf of Attila Mesterhazy, Rapporteur of the Sub-Committee on Transatlantic Defence and Security Cooperation, of the draft Resolution on *Burden Sharing: New Commitments In A New Era*, submitted by the Defence and Security Committee; debate and vote on the draft Resolution [217 DSC 18 E rev. 1]**

**Joseph A. Day** (Canada) presented the draft resolution.

**Gerald Connolly** (United States) spoke.

**Joseph A. Day** (Canada) responded.

**Luca Frusone** (Italy) moved **Amendment N° 1** as follows:

After sub-paragraph 15c, insert the following new sub-paragraph:

*to contribute to NATO operations and missions.*

**Joseph A. Day** (Canada) responded.

**Amendment N° 1 was rejected.**

**The draft resolution [217 DSC 18 E rev. 1] was adopted with one vote against and seven abstentions.**

10. **Presentation by Ivans Klementjevs, on behalf of Jean-Marie Bockel, General Rapporteur of the Economics and Security Committee on the draft Resolution on *Opportunities and Challenges in a Changing Space Arena*, submitted by the Committee; debate and vote on the draft Resolution [219 ESC 18 E rev. 1]**

**Ivans Klementjevs** (Latvia) presented the draft resolution.

**The draft resolution [219 ESC 18 E rev. 1] was adopted unanimously.**

11. **Presentation by Lord Jopling, Special Rapporteur of the Committee on the Civil Dimension of Security, of the draft Resolution on *Updating the Response to Russia's Hybrid Tactics*, submitted by the Committee; debate and vote on the draft Resolution [215 CDS 18 E rev. 1]**

**Lord Jopling** (United Kingdom) presented the draft resolution.

**The draft resolution [215 CDS 18 E rev. 1] was adopted, with two votes against and one abstention.**

12. **Presentation by Jane Cordy, Rapporteur of the Sub-Committee on Democratic Governance, of the draft Resolution on *Security and Cooperation in the High North*, submitted by the Committee on the Civil Dimension of Security; debate and vote on the draft Resolution [216 CDS 18 E rev. 1]**

**Jane Cordy** (Canada) presented the draft resolution.

**Gerald Connolly** (United States) spoke, asking the Assembly to follow up on the recommendation included in his report [172 PCTR 17 E rev.1 fin] on *NATO and Security in the Arctic* that NATO should report to the Assembly on an annual basis on developments in the Arctic and NATO's response.

**Jane Cordy** (Canada) responded, supporting the suggestion as well as an active examination by the Assembly of developments in the High North.

**The draft resolution [216 CDS 18 E rev. 1] was adopted with two abstentions.**

- 13. Presentation by Leona Alleslev, General Rapporteur of the Science and Technology Committee, of the draft Resolution on *Maintaining the Science and Technology Edge and Enhancing Alliance Agility*, submitted by the Committee; debate and vote on the draft Resolution [223 STC 18 E rev. 1]**

**Leona Alleslev** (Canada) presented the draft resolution.

**The draft resolution [223 STC 18 E rev. 1] was adopted unanimously.**

- 14. Presentation by Joseph A. Day, General Rapporteur of the Defence and Security Committee, of the draft Resolution on *Reinforcing NATO's Deterrence in the East*, submitted by the Committee; debate and vote on the draft Resolution [218 DSC 18 E rev. 1]**

**Joseph A. Day** (Canada) presented the draft resolution.

**Roberta Pinotti** (Italy) moved **Amendment N° 3** presented by Luca Frusone (Italy) as follows:

After paragraph 14, insert the following new paragraph:

*Supporting NATO's adaptation at 360 degrees and the need for NATO tools and doctrines to be relevant in all strategic directions;*

**Roberta Pinotti** (Italy) moved **Amendment N° 4** presented by Luca Frusone (Italy) as follows:

After paragraph 14, insert the following new paragraph:

*Upholding NATO's dual track approach towards Russia, based on a combination of deterrence, defence and dialogue;*

**Juozas Olekas** (Lithuania) spoke.

**Franklin van Kappen** (Netherlands) spoke.

**Joseph A. Day** (Canada) responded.

**Amendment N° 3 was rejected.**

**Amendment N° 4 was adopted.**

**Malahat Ibrahimgizi** (Azerbaijan) moved **Amendment N° 1** as follows:

At the end of sub-paragraph 15 c, insert the words:

*And to reinforce the security of energy projects such as BTC, TANAP, TAP and other pipelines;*

**Malahat Ibrahimgizi** (Azerbaijan) moved **Amendment N° 2** as follows:

At sub-paragraph 15 i, after the words “A2/AD environment” insert the words:

*and against the threats emanating from short-range Iskander missiles deployed in Kaliningrad, Crimea, Syria and Armenia.*

**Kamil Aydin** (Turkey) spoke.

**Olga Bielkova** (Ukraine) spoke.

**Andrea Giorgio Felice Orsini** (Italy) spoke.

**Joseph A. Day** (Canada) responded.

**Malahat Ibrahimgizi** (Azerbaijan) proposed an oral amendment to **Amendment N° 1** to delete the words:

*such as BTC, TANAP, TAP and other pipelines*

**Joseph A. Day** (Canada) responded.

Amendment N° 1, as amended, was agreed.

**Christian Tybring-Gjedde** (Norway) spoke, noting the oral amendment had not been clearly explained.

**The President** reiterated that the proposal was now as follows:

At the end of sub-paragraph 15 c, insert the words:

*And to reinforce the security of energy projects;*

**Malahat Ibrahimgizi** (Azerbaijan) protested against a new vote.

**The President** responded, asking the Assembly to take a new vote.

**Amendment N° 1, as amended, was agreed.**

**The President** put Amendment N°2 to a vote.

**Malahat Ibrahimgizi** (Azerbaijan) intervened.

**The President** responded, asking Ms Ibrahimgizi not to interrupt the vote.

**Amendment N° 2 was rejected.**

**The draft resolution [218 DSC 18 E rev. 1], as amended, was adopted with one abstention.**

15. **Presentation by Ausrine Armonaite, Rapporteur of the Sub-Committee on Transition and Development, of the draft Resolution on *Energy Security: A Strategic Challenge For The Alliance*, submitted by the Economics and Security Committee; debate and vote on the draft Resolution [220 ESC 18 E rev. 1]**

**Ausrine Armonaite** (Lithuania) presented the draft resolution.

**Kamil Aydin** (Turkey) spoke, noting that the Turkish delegation would have to vote against the draft resolution on account of the reference made to the Eastern Mediterranean in the second part of paragraph 4.

**Olga Bielkova** (Ukraine) spoke.

**Ausrine Armonaite** (Lithuania) responded.

**The draft resolution [220 ESC 18 E rev. 1] was adopted with sixteen votes against and one abstention.**

16. **Presentation by Julio Miranda Calha, General Rapporteur of the Political Committee, of the draft Resolution on *Reinforcing NATO's Contribution to Tackling the Challenges from the South*, submitted by the Committee; debate and vote on the draft Resolution [221 PC 18 E rev. 1]**

**Julio Miranda Calha** (Portugal) presented the draft resolution.

**The draft resolution [221 PC 18 E rev. 1] was adopted with two votes against.**

17. **Presentation by Susan Davis, General Rapporteur of the Science and Technology Committee, of the draft Resolution on *Safeguarding Elections in the Alliance*, submitted by the Committee; debate and vote on the draft Resolution [222 STC 18 E rev. 1]**

**Susan Davis** (United States) presented the draft resolution.

**The draft resolution [222 STC 18 E rev. 1] was adopted with two abstentions.**

## 18. **Closure of the Session**

**Lord Jopling** (United Kingdom) congratulated the President on her contribution to the Assembly.

**The President** thanked Lord Jopling and Members of the Assembly and called Borys Wrzesnewskyj, Head of the Canadian delegation, to make some closing remarks.

**Borys Wrzesnewskyj** thanked participants, the NATO PA secretariat and the Canadian Parliament's staff. It had been an honour to host the NATO PA in Canada.

**The President** thanked Borys Wrzesnewskyj, and all those who helped to make the session run so smoothly.

**The President** announced that the Spring Session would take place in May 2019 in Bratislava, Slovakia.

**The Session was closed at 14:06.**

---