

POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE NATO PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY – 2019



NATO PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY
ASSEMBLEE PARLEMENTAIRE DE L'OTAN

DCAF Geneva Centre
for Security Sector
Governance

The publication of this book has been funded by the Directorate for Security Policy (SIPOL) – Swiss Federal Department of Defense, Civil Protection and Sports.

**POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS
OF THE NATO PARLIAMENTARY
ASSEMBLY – 2019**

Brussels – Geneva 2020

*Policy Recommendations of the NATO Parliamentary Assembly – 2019 (Brussels / Geneva:
NATO Parliamentary Assembly / Geneva Centre for Security Sector Governance, 2020)*

© NATO Parliamentary Assembly, 2020

© Geneva Centre for Security Sector Governance, 2020

Copyeditor: Jeanine Beck

Cover Design: DTP Design Studio

ISBN: 92-9222-514-6

CONTENTS

Introduction – NATO @ 70: Parliamentary Perspectives on NATO's Current and Future Priorities.....	1
Resolution 454 on Reaffirming Commitment to NATO's Founding Principles and Values.....	4
Resolution 455 on Supporting NATO's Post-inf Treaty Defence and Deterrence Posture.....	7
Resolution 456 on Recent Developments in Afghanistan.....	10
Resolution 457 on NATO @ 70: Celebrating 70 Years of Peace and Security Through Unity.....	12
Resolution 458 on Tackling Security Challenges From Africa.....	14
Resolution 459 on Strengthening NATO Cyber Security, Defence, and Deterrence.....	16
Appendix: The NATO Parliamentary Assembly.....	18

FOREWORD

The Geneva Centre for Security Sector Governance (DCAF) works intensively with the NATO Parliamentary Assembly (PA) to promote democratic civilian control and oversight of the security sector. It provides an in-kind contribution to the Parliamentary Training Programmes, Rose-Roth Seminars and NATO Orientation Programme. DCAF supports NATO PA–European Parliament seminars and produces studies to address parliamentary practices and procedures in NATO member states with regards the oversight. In light of this intense cooperation, DCAF publishes NATO PA Resolutions and Recommendations annually and they are widely seen as important indications of the political debate on key topics within the Alliance.

This year's publication is comprised of six resolutions adopted by the NATO Parliamentary Assembly. Resolution 454 stresses the shared commitment of NATO Allies to fundamental values, such as democracy, human rights and the rule of law. It calls for unified protection of these values and a decisive response to all those undermining them. Resolution 457 celebrates 70 years of NATO's integral role in advancing peace and security in the Euro-Atlantic area, as an important achievement, and applauds the efforts that have been made by the Allies. The four other resolutions focus on supporting NATO's post-INF treaty defence and deterrence posture, the recent developments in Afghanistan, security challenges in Africa, and on strengthening NATO cyber security, defence and deterrence.

The NATO PA and DCAF would like to commend the financial support of the Swiss Federal Department of Defence, Civil Protection and Sport, and are looking forward to sharing the NATO 2019 policy recommendations with the public.

Brussels and Geneva, February 2020.

Darko Stančić

DCAF

Assistant Director

Head, Europe and Central Asia, Operations

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Darko Stančić', is positioned below the text. The signature is fluid and cursive, with a large initial 'D' and a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.

Introduction

NATO @ 70: Parliamentary Perspectives on NATO's Current and Future Priorities

Ruxandra Popa and Henrik Bliddal¹

In 2019, NATO celebrated its 70th anniversary. On 4 April 1949, 12 nations signed the Washington Treaty, NATO's founding document. Since then, NATO has advanced peace and prosperity, stability, and security in the Euro-Atlantic area. Today, it remains the cornerstone of transatlantic security.

Celebrations for NATO's 70th anniversary included a meeting of NATO foreign ministers in Washington on the anniversary day, as well as NATO Secretary General Jens Stoltenberg's address to a Joint Session of the United States Congress – the first time a NATO Secretary General has been invited to address Congress. Allied Heads of State and Government also met in London in December to reaffirm their commitment to NATO and take stock of the Alliance's adaptation.

The NATO Parliamentary Assembly also marked the anniversary by celebrating the achievements of the Alliance, reflecting upon the past, and most importantly, looking ahead to the future of NATO. The policy recommendations included in the six resolutions presented here represent the collective views of 266 legislators, from across the Alliance, on NATO's current and future priorities.

The NATO PA is a body independent from but complementary to NATO. It brings together national legislators from the 29 – soon to be 30 – members of NATO as well as some 30 parliamentary partners. The Assembly's main mission is to strengthen the transatlantic bond and promote greater awareness and understanding of NATO policies among parliamentarians and the wider public, thereby supporting parliamentary oversight of security and defence, and the transparency of defence policies. Crucially, members of the NATO PA, as the elected representatives of the people, also embody the democratic values and principles upon which NATO was founded.

As part of the regular interactions between NATO and the Assembly, the NATO PA's resolutions are communicated to national parliaments, governments, and NATO authorities. The NATO Secretary General replies in writing to each of them. The resolutions are the most visible expression of the Assembly's collective views. However, they are only one aspect of the NATO PA's annual work programme, which normally includes about 15 in-depth reports and 35–40 meetings.

This publication presents the resolutions the Assembly adopted during the Annual Session in London, United Kingdom, in October 2019. These review some of the key security challenges facing Europe and North America, and NATO's response to them.

Seventy years after the founding of NATO, Europe and North America confront a particularly complex spectrum of threats, including:

¹ Ruxandra Popa is the Secretary General and Henrik Bliddal the Deputy Secretary General of the NATO Parliamentary Assembly.

- An uncooperative and aggressive Russia;
- Instability across North Africa, the Middle East, and Central Asia;
- The persistent threat of terrorism;
- The challenges of China's rise;
- The unfinished European and Euro-Atlantic integration process;
- Growing cyber and hybrid threats;
- Disinformation and attempts by outside actors to undermine our democratic institutions; and
- The proliferation of weapons of mass destruction and other advanced military technology.

How NATO should adapt to these threats is a key theme of the 2019 resolutions.

Resolution 454 on Reaffirming Commitment to NATO's Founding Principles and Values and **Resolution 457 on NATO @ 70: Celebrating 70 Years of Peace and Security Through Unity** take stock of NATO's multiple cycles of adaptation since 1949 and provide broad recommendations for the future. Among other things, they underline the need for:

- Discussions on a new Strategic Concept – the policy document defining the threat environment and NATO's priorities on a 10-year horizon;
- Increased defence spending;
- Improved efforts to counter hybrid threats;
- Better communication regarding NATO;
- Keeping the door open to NATO aspirant countries and developing closer ties with other partners; and
- Continuing to champion the Women, Peace, and Security agenda of the United Nations.

Importantly, resolutions 454 and 457 also focus on Europe and North America's shared commitment to the values of democracy, individual liberty, human rights, and the rule of law. They call on Allies to protect these values and resolutely counter those who seek to undermine the democratic foundations of societies and institutions in the Euro-Atlantic area. At the same time, both resolutions suggest designating a structure within the NATO institutions focused on developing democracy resiliency programmes. This structure would monitor and report on the democratic credentials of member and candidate states, when there is reasonable ground for it, and offer assistance when needed.

The other resolutions look at more specific priorities for NATO adaptation.

Resolution 455 on Supporting NATO's Post-INF Treaty Defence and Deterrence Posture focuses on NATO's nuclear deterrence and its response to Russia's violation of the Treaty on Intermediate-Range Nuclear Forces (INF). NATO maintains a longstanding commitment to arms control and supports the Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons (NPT) – the cornerstone of the global nuclear non-proliferation regime. At the same time, Allies have made it clear that, as long as they exist, nuclear weapons must remain a core component of the Alliance's defence and deterrence posture. Among other things, the resolution, therefore, urges Allied government and parliamentary leaders to explain to their populations the indispensable role of the Alliance's nuclear capabilities for preventing conflict. It also welcomes NATO's defensive, measured and responsible response to the demise of the INF Treaty, which includes a mix of exercises, intelligence, surveillance and reconnaissance, air and missile defences and conventional capabilities.

In **Resolution 459 Strengthening NATO Cyber Security, Defence, and Deterrence**, the Assembly addresses the growing challenges Allied countries face in cyber space. It urges them to strengthen their cyber security, defence, and deterrence. Importantly, it calls on member nations to fulfil their national cyber commitments and redouble their cyber efforts – from capability development to strengthening effective cyber partnerships. To deter cyber attacks, member nations should signal resolve and credibility as well as continue to seek to reduce escalatory risks. Looking ahead, Allies and partners should recognise the long-term strategic risk of persistent cyber campaigns and intensify consultations on how to counter such campaigns.

Resolutions 456 and 458 focus, respectively, on one area where NATO is actively involved – Afghanistan – and another – Africa – where NATO and individual Allies could contribute more actively to security and stability.

The Assembly continues to follow developments in Afghanistan closely. NATO's principal goal in the country is to actively support the stabilisation of Afghanistan and to contribute to the establishment of sustainable peace, so that it will never again become a haven for international terrorism. In **Resolution 456 on Recent Developments in Afghanistan**, the Assembly urges Allies and partners contributing to international efforts in Afghanistan to maintain the security force assistance missions until a peace agreement is reached. All stakeholders should fully support inclusive intra-Afghan peace negotiations. The resolution also calls for strengthened parliamentary institutions and ensuring women gain their proper role in Afghanistan's political processes.

In 2019, the NATO PA also focused heavily on Africa – a region NATO is less engaged in. The Assembly has long argued that the Euro-Atlantic community's security, prosperity, and stability are directly linked to developments in North Africa and regions further south, most importantly the Sahel. In **Resolution 458 on Tackling Security Challenges from Africa**, the Assembly urges Allies and partners to improve situational awareness of challenges in Africa and strengthen assistance efforts, including capacity-building efforts, dialogue and information exchange, and training of security forces. Moreover, NATO should explore closer cooperation with the European Union on Africa and further partnerships with African actors, potentially expanding NATO's Partnership for Peace (PfP) Programme to Sub-Saharan African states.

We sincerely hope these policy recommendations help the reader better understand the added value parliamentary diplomacy can bring to security and defence. This publication should also offer a taste of the breadth and depth of the Assembly's role in reinforcing the unique ties that bind Europe and North America and in ensuring NATO member nations and partners are better prepared to keep our societies safe.

The Assembly's members are the democratically elected representatives of the people in all member states of the Alliance. Their voice is, therefore, also that of the Alliance's citizens. This volume is dedicated to them. We would like to thank DCAF – the Geneva Centre for Security Sector Governance – and the Directorate for Security Policy of the Swiss Federal Department of Defence, Civil Protection and Sport for supporting its production.



POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS

adopted by the

NATO PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY

in 2019

RESOLUTION 454

on

REAFFIRMING COMMITMENT TO NATO'S FOUNDING PRINCIPLES AND VALUES²

The Assembly,

1. **Celebrating** the 70th anniversary of the transatlantic Alliance – a unique political-military community of like-minded nations and a bulwark of the free world;
2. **Convinced** that the enduring prominence of this Alliance as a major international actor not only stems from the military, economic, and technological strength of its members, but also from the commitment to the shared principles and values that underpin the transatlantic community;
3. **Recalling** that the North Atlantic Treaty, signed on 4 April 1949 in Washington, D.C., stipulates in its preamble the determination of the Allies “to safeguard the freedom, common heritage and civilisation of their peoples, founded on the principles of democracy, individual liberty and the rule of law”, and that, in Article 2, the Allies express their commitment to “strengthening their free institutions”;
4. **Noting** that, particularly after the fall of the Berlin Wall, NATO contributed significantly to the spread of democratic principles across the Euro-Atlantic area, and beyond, through political statements, the Open Door policy, and partnership mechanisms;
5. **Recalling** its own role as a forum to discuss the democratic credentials of NATO members during the Cold War and its activities in the post-Cold War era, supporting new democracies and helping them to develop mechanisms of parliamentary oversight of the defence and security sector;
6. **Stressing** that after the end of the Cold War, many nations broke free and were able to join NATO, and **lamenting** that some of them are still fighting for their freedom and their right to freely choose their foreign policy vector and to join the Alliance;
7. **Mindful** of the ongoing paradigm shifts in the global political and security landscape as a result of significant technological, economic, and demographic developments, and **aware** that these developments can empower autocrats and lead to a global erosion of democracy and human rights standards;

² presented by the Committee on the Civil Dimension of Security and adopted by the Plenary Assembly on Monday 14 October 2019, London, United Kingdom.

8. **Deeply concerned** that the Euro-Atlantic nations are not immune to phenomena such as decreasing popular confidence in political institutions, disenchantment with mainstream parties, and media and general democratic backsliding, which can jeopardise the trust among the Allies;
9. **Deploring** external interference, particularly by the Russian Federation, in the democratic processes in North America and Europe, the aggression against Ukraine and Georgia, and attempts to undermine the Alliance's unity and deepen internal cleavages through cyber intrusions, social media manipulation, and other hybrid tactics;
10. **Emphasising**, nevertheless, that the founding principles and values of the Alliance remain valid and continue to define the Alliance's identity;
11. **URGES** member governments and parliaments of the North Atlantic Alliance to take a more proactive approach in promoting and protecting democratic values within the Euro-Atlantic community and beyond, and in particular:
 - a. to consider designating a structure within NATO institutions with a mandate and capacity to monitor and report – in a respectful and constructive manner – on the democratic credentials of member and candidate states, when there is reasonable ground for it, and to offer assistance to member states on election integrity and security, judicial independence, press freedom, and other aspects critical to maintaining a vibrant democracy;
 - b. to consider updating NATO's Strategic Concept to include stronger commitment to democratic values and to expand references to democracy, human rights, and the rule of law in NATO's external communication, including NATO Summit Communiqués;
 - c. to ensure adequate support to relevant Centres of Excellence, particularly the NATO Cooperative Cyber Defence Centre of Excellence, the NATO Strategic Communications Centre of Excellence, and the European Centre of Excellence for Countering Hybrid Threats, in order to support democracy resilience programmes in member states;
 - d. to exchange best practices and innovative techniques and to develop further cooperation with the EU in enhancing the cyber literacy of citizens and in tackling disinformation, hate speech, and other hybrid threats;
 - e. to identify national electoral systems as strategic infrastructure and provide them with adequate protection and to raise awareness among officials and participants of electoral campaigns on how to detect and prevent hostile interference;
 - f. to support the NATO Public Diplomacy Division and relevant national actors, including parliamentarians, in their efforts to reach out to new generations of Europeans and North Americans and to spread awareness of NATO's core missions and values;
 - g. to reaffirm commitment to NATO's Open Door policy as a tool to spread the zone of stability and democratic standards in Europe, to support the Euro-Atlantic integration of Bosnia and Herzegovina, Georgia, and Ukraine, and to help strengthen their resilience against foreign interference;
 - h. to support multilateral efforts to sanction human rights abusers;
 - i. to foster the implementation of NATO's Women, Peace, and Security agenda and to mainstream gender through all NATO policies;
 - j. to redouble efforts on the national, regional, and international levels to tackle the root causes of public discontent, including migration and income inequality;
 - k. to encourage authoritative figures in politics, culture, and science to help rebuild public support for democratic values and the rules-based global order;

- I. to continue using the NATO Parliamentary Assembly as a venue for Allies to exchange their views on how to defend and promote NATO's core principles within the Alliance and beyond.
12. **URGES** international social media corporations to allocate sufficient resources to work with relevant international organisations, including NATO, its member states and partner nations as well as their civil societies, to identify and counter disinformation and social media manipulation efforts aimed at influencing the free electoral choices of member and partner nations.

RESOLUTION 455
on
SUPPORTING NATO'S POST-INF TREATY DEFENCE
AND DETERRENCE POSTURE³

The Assembly,

1. **Recognising** that the Alliance's populations and territories, particularly its eastern territories, as well as neighbouring countries, already face significant and escalating conventional and hybrid threats;
2. **Alert** to efforts by states such as North Korea and Iran to develop new, powerful, and precise ballistic and cruise missile systems and, given these countries' disregard for international law and potential willingness to arm these weapons with nuclear warheads, **concerned** about the threat that this poses to international security;
3. **Aware** of China's renewed focus on its nuclear capabilities to enhance the size, robustness, precision, and mobility of its nuclear systems and **recognising** that China's efforts to modernise and expand its nuclear arsenal threaten to destabilise international peace and security;
4. **Concerned** about Russia's concerted efforts to modernise its existing strategic and tactical nuclear forces and **troubled** by its endeavours to develop new destabilising nuclear weapons with the goal of overwhelming any defences against them;
5. **Emphasising** the dangers associated with Russia's renewed focus on nuclear weapons development, as illustrated by recent incidents involving Russia's experimental nuclear weapons systems;
6. **Underscoring** that Russia's use of aggressive nuclear rhetoric, the combination of conventional and nuclear elements in its military exercising, and the continued ambiguity of its nuclear doctrine signal a potentially lower threshold for the use of nuclear weapons;
7. **Regretting** that these developments demonstrate Russia's determination to use nuclear weapons as a key means to assert its position as a global power;
8. **Underlining** that, despite the Budapest Memorandum, which guarantees the respect of Ukraine's existing borders, security and sovereignty, Russia's attack on Ukraine, its subsequent annexation of Crimea and occupation of certain territories of Donetsk and Luhansk regions has undermined global nuclear non-proliferation efforts;
9. **Reprehending** Russia's preparations for deployment of nuclear arms in Crimea;
10. **Condemning** Russian violations of the Intermediate-Range Nuclear Forces (INF) Treaty, which had been a pillar of stability in European security for over three decades, and **strongly supporting** the United States' decision to withdraw from the treaty after that country's extensive efforts to bring Russia back into compliance;
11. **Blaming** Russia's actions for the failure of the INF Treaty and diminished trust and stability within bilateral arms control frameworks, which may result in negative impacts on future efforts to limit the development and deployment of nuclear armaments;

³ presented by the Defence and Security Committee and adopted by the Plenary Assembly on Monday 14 October 2019, London, United Kingdom.

12. **Underscoring** NATO's decision to respond to the end of the INF Treaty in a "measured and responsible way" with regard to the deployment of new land-based missiles in Europe;
13. **Strongly endorsing** the Alliance's announcement that it will both ensure that its nuclear deterrent remains safe, secure and effective and explore options to "work on issues" such as: exercises, intelligence, surveillance and reconnaissance, air and missile defences, and conventional capabilities;
14. **Reiterating** NATO's longstanding commitment to arms control, as stated in the 2018 Brussels Summit Declaration, and its enduring support for the Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons (NPT);
15. **Noting** the ongoing debate about the potential extension of the New Strategic Arms Reduction Treaty (New START), now the only remaining strategic nuclear arms control agreement between the United States and Russia - which is due to expire in 2021, and **encouraging** its extension;
16. **Affirming** that, as long as they exist, nuclear weapons must remain a core component of the Alliance's defence and deterrence posture and that NATO's nuclear declaratory language must signal Allies' preparedness to take the steps necessary to defend themselves;
17. **Highlighting** that nuclear modernisation efforts by the United States, France, and the United Kingdom are necessary to ensure the safety and reliability of existing arsenals and to respond to the evolving nuclear environment, and that they do not contravene these countries' international treaty commitments and obligations;
18. **Underscoring** the necessity of maintaining the full complement of NATO's nuclear deterrence mission, including Allied support for US forward-deployed nuclear weapons and the systems necessary for their maintenance and potential deployment;
19. **URGES** member governments and parliaments of the North Atlantic Alliance:
 - a. to continue to support the Alliance's maintenance of a safe, secure, strong, capable, and survivable nuclear deterrent as a central pillar of its defence and deterrence policy in order to ensure the peace and security of Allied populations and territories and to mitigate against the dangers of an evolving international security environment characterised by the development and deployment of modern and destabilising nuclear weapons;
 - b. to continue the investments necessary to modernise existing nuclear systems and their supporting infrastructures across the full complement of NATO's nuclear mission, including the maintenance of US forward-deployed nuclear weapons;
 - c. to stand behind and adequately resource new defence and deterrence measures taken by the Alliance in response to the evolving post-INF Treaty security environment, including increased exercises, intelligence, surveillance and reconnaissance, air and missile defences, and conventional capabilities;
 - d. to educate their populations about the indispensable nature of the Alliance's nuclear capabilities within its broader defence and deterrence posture and, therefore, about the necessity of providing sufficient resources to maintain safe and reliable nuclear capabilities;
 - e. to support NATO's efforts to maintain the NPT as the cornerstone of the global nuclear non-proliferation regime to prevent the spread of nuclear weapons and to encourage other states to join international arms control, disarmament, and non-proliferation initiatives reflecting the nuclear weapons environment that Allies seek to mitigate for the sake of broader international peace and security.

RESOLUTION 456
on
RECENT DEVELOPMENTS IN AFGHANISTAN⁴

The Assembly,

1. **Recalling** that Afghanistan remains a high priority for NATO Allies and their international partners, whose principal mission is to actively support the stabilisation of Afghanistan and to contribute to the establishment of sustainable peace in this country, so that it will never again become a haven for international terrorism;
2. **Honouring** the more than 3,000 NATO and partner country forces who died as part of the effort to bring peace and stability to Afghanistan, and **recognising** the tens of billions of dollars contributed by those countries to rebuild and develop Afghanistan;
3. **Welcoming** the Alliance's decision at the 2018 Brussels Summit to maintain the Resolute Support Mission (RSM), which trains, advises, and assists the Afghanistan National Defense and Security Forces (ANDSF) in their mission to protect the people and territory of Afghanistan;
4. **Concerned** by faltering progress in security sector reform in the country, which impedes ANDSF capacity and readiness and prolongs ANDSF dependence on external assistance;
5. **Worried** about increasing instability and a precipitous rise of civilian casualties due to the Taliban's intensified military efforts to seize more territory and maximise leverage at the negotiating table;
6. **Troubled** by the continued and escalating attacks by the international terrorist group, the ISIL-KP, also known as Daesh, in its effort to sow instability and jeopardise peace negotiations;
7. **Disappointed** the narcotics trade continues to flourish in the country, providing a key income source for the Taliban and other armed insurgent groups, fueling widespread institutional corruption, particularly in the security and justice sectors, and sustaining a nexus of destabilising criminal networks in the country, across the region, and globally;
8. **Encouraged** by the July 2019 Intra-Afghan Conference for Peace, which brought together a wide range of key stakeholders in Afghanistan and agreed on a formula for future inclusive negotiations;
9. **Urging** key parties to the ongoing conflict in Afghanistan to strive for constructive and inclusive Intra-Afghan peace negotiations, in order to facilitate a settlement reflecting a shared understanding of Afghanistan's future;
10. **Concerned** by the impact of factional disagreements inside the National Assembly of Afghanistan on the execution of its duties, resulting in its increasing marginalization by the executive branch in the policy-making process;
11. **Underlining** that only an independent, effective, accountable, and transparent justice sector can ensure the establishment of the rule of law, increase trust in the country's institutions, and mitigate corruption;

⁴ presented by the Defence and Security Committee and adopted by the Plenary Assembly on Monday 14 October 2019, London, United Kingdom.

12. **Recalling** progress made in key areas to rebuild and strengthen Afghanistan since the fall of the Taliban in 2001, including: improved access to running water, electricity, and medicine, increasing overall health indices; a stronger and more inclusive educational system; the incorporation of women into all sectors of society, particularly law enforcement and peace-building efforts; and a more diverse and growing economy;
13. **Encouraged** both by the significant advances made by Afghan women across all sectors of society and by the determination Afghan women have shown in seeking to preserve and safeguard those gains;
14. **Acknowledging**, however, that socioeconomic progress has been highly uneven across the country and that international financial support will remain vital to cover Afghanistan's continuing operational budgets and development programmes;
15. **Reaffirming** the commitment made by NATO member states to extend financial support for Afghan security forces through 2024 and **recognising** the vital role that this support and broader development assistance plays in developing the Afghan government and improving the lives of Afghans;
16. **URGES** member governments and parliaments of the North Atlantic Alliance and their partners contributing to international efforts in Afghanistan:
 - a. to continue to assist the ANDSF by enhancing the effectiveness of ongoing security assistance programmes to build a capable, self-sustaining, and professional military force working to create the conditions for enduring peace and stability in Afghanistan;
 - b. to maintain their security force assistance missions in Afghanistan until a peace agreement is reached to provide a necessary counterbalance to the ongoing efforts by insurgent groups to spoil a potential peace settlement, reconstruction efforts, and regional stability;
 - c. to fully support inclusive intra-Afghan peace negotiations and to help sustain a resulting peace agreement by providing long-term financial and technical assistance to major post-conflict challenges, such as the reintegration of former Taliban fighters into society, the promotion of economic growth, and the development of the Afghan National Police;
 - d. to support the Afghan parliament in its efforts to become an essential legislative body working for the broader good of the entire Afghan nation;
 - e. to do everything possible to ensure that Afghan women have seats at the table during peace negotiations and to support a final settlement that preserves the hard-won rights of Afghan women and girls;
17. **CALLS UPON** the government and National Assembly of Afghanistan:
 - a. to insist upon a peace settlement protecting the political, economic, and civil society achievements reached in Afghanistan since 2001, and to include the significant and enduring participation of women across all sectors of society in that settlement;
 - b. to stop factional infighting and respect the Afghan parliament's rightful role in the legislative process, and to accelerate broad-based institutional reforms to create the conditions necessary for legitimate and effective governance and the broad enforcement of the rule of law across the country.

RESOLUTION 457
on
NATO @ 70: CELEBRATING 70 YEARS OF PEACE
AND SECURITY THROUGH UNITY⁵

The Assembly,

1. **Underlining** that NATO has advanced peace and security in the Euro-Atlantic area for more than 70 years and **reaffirming** that the Alliance remains the cornerstone of transatlantic security;
2. **Stressing** that its unique strength lies in Europe and North America's commitment to ensure each other's security, and **reaffirming** that all Allies are committed to the fundamental principle, enshrined in Article 5 of the Washington Treaty, that an attack against one Ally is considered as an attack against all Allies;
3. **Acknowledging** that threats such as extreme nationalism and polarised societies challenge the Alliance from within;
4. **Welcoming** the meeting of NATO Heads of State and Government in London in December 2019 to celebrate NATO's anniversary as an opportunity to ensure that the Alliance is prepared for future security challenges;
5. **Noting** that NATO continues to be the most successful security organisation because it has been credible and that that credibility is based on NATO's military capabilities and a common unity of purpose;
6. **Emphasising** that NATO's success is also due to its adherence to common values: a commitment to democracy, individual liberty, human rights, and the rule of law;
7. **Welcoming** the tangible progress on Allied defence spending and military equipment modernisation following the Defence Investment Pledge made at the 2014 Wales Summit, but also **noting** that the relative imbalance in defence spending and military capabilities within NATO remains to be addressed;
8. **Convinced** that the prospect of further enlargement and the spirit of cooperative security promote stability and security in the Euro-Atlantic region and **reaffirming** its commitment to, and support for, NATO's Open Door policy;
9. **Stressing** the crucial contribution of NATO partnerships, such as the Mediterranean Dialogue, to security and stability in the EuroAtlantic area, the MENA region and beyond;
10. **Applauding** the important steps taken to strengthen NATO-EU cooperation, and **recognising** the strategic potential that could be realised by further exploiting their complementary capabilities;
11. **Recognising** that Russia's aggressive stance and actions and continued instability on NATO's southern flank challenge the security of NATO member and partner countries and pose new security threats, including in the cyber domain;
12. **Aware** that global trends such as shifts in economic and military power, demographics, and rapidly developing technologies require NATO to continuously revisit its strategic outlook;

⁵ presented by the Political Committee and adopted by the Plenary Assembly on Monday 14 October 2019, London, United Kingdom.

13. **URGES** member governments and parliaments of the North Atlantic Alliance:

- a. to update the Strategic Concept to reflect the new security environment, in particular with regard to cyber and hybrid threats, the aggressive behaviour of Russia, the growing prominence of China, the threats to the Alliance's southern flank due to the persistence of Islamist terrorist groups and the fragility of some state structures in that region;
- b. to continue and reinforce efforts to implement the Defence Investment Pledge as fair sharing of the defence burden is crucial for Alliance cohesion and necessary to rebuild and maintain the military capabilities to deter and defend against potential adversaries;
- c. to rededicate the Alliance to the shared democratic values that constitute its founding principles by developing democracy resiliency programmes in member states and by considering the creation of a Democratic Resiliency Coordination Centre (DRCC) within NATO's institutional structure in order to help NATO member states strengthen democratic institutions;
- d. to ensure adequate support to relevant Centres of Excellence, particularly the NATO Cooperative Cyber Defence Centre of Excellence, the NATO Strategic Communications Centre of Excellence and the European Centre of Excellence for Countering Hybrid Threats, in order to support democracy resilience programmes in member states;
- e. to develop the NATO-EU relationship further, particularly in the fields of cyber defence and military mobility;
- f. to continue supporting its partners in the East – Ukraine and Georgia in particular – against Russian interference, and to maintain, and if possible increase, assistance for their reform processes, especially for those countries aspiring to integrate into Euro-Atlantic structures (currently Bosnia-Herzegovina, Georgia and Ukraine);
- g. to continue to develop political and practical cooperation with NATO partners, including the United Nations, the African Union, the Arab League, and the Gulf Cooperation Council;
- h. to work towards opening up more partnerships with Latin American countries, following the example of Colombia, to strengthen the security and stability of the Euro-Atlantic area and to promote our shared commitment to democracy, the rule of law, human rights, and individual liberty.

RESOLUTION 458
on
TACKLING SECURITY CHALLENGES FROM AFRICA⁶

The Assembly,

1. **Emphasising** that security on NATO's southern flank is closely intertwined with the stability of the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) region, which is itself heavily impacted by the volatility of the countries further south;
2. **Deeply concerned** about the deteriorating security situation in Libya caused by jihadists and the strengthening of Russian military support to Libyan militia leaders, which escalates insecurity and chaos and leads to further destabilisation;
3. **Recognising** that the interplay between corruption, weak institutions, radicalisation, terrorism, and illicit trafficking of arms, drugs, and people causes endemic insecurity in large parts of the continent;
4. **Recognising** that the expansion of militant Islamist groups beyond the Sahel region creates a belt of violent extremism in Africa;
5. **Welcoming** the decrease in irregular migration over the Mediterranean but **acknowledging** that the underlying causes driving migration have not yet been addressed;
6. **Noting** that NATO has recently been putting greater emphasis on challenges emanating from Africa and that the Framework for the South seeks to integrate and streamline NATO's approach to its southern neighbours;
7. **Applauding** the creation of the NATO Hub for the South in Naples, as it increases awareness of security not only in the MENA region but also in the areas south of it;
8. **Recognising** that NATO's approach to the South focuses on three pillars:
 - a. strengthening NATO's deterrence and defence against threats from the South,
 - b. contributing to international crisis management efforts in the region, and
 - c. helping regional partners build resilience against security threats such as terrorism;
9. **Underlining** the need for enhanced cooperation between NATO, the EU and the African Union (AU) to provide in-depth support to countries in Africa and the Middle East interested in comprehensive political and economic reform programmes;
10. **URGES** member governments and parliaments of the North Atlantic Alliance and NATO partners:
 - a. to improve situational awareness, by enhancing early-warning capabilities to monitor instability and security in Africa e.g. through improved intelligence sharing among Allies and partner countries at the Hub for the South and through greater coordination with the early-warning mechanism within the EU, in order to create a new NATO-EU cooperation area thus enhancing NATO's capabilities to monitor potential threats;

⁶ presented by the Political Committee and adopted by the Plenary Assembly on Monday 14 October 2019, London, United Kingdom.

- b. to engage in capacity-building efforts, dialogue and information exchange, and training of security forces in the Sahel region to prevent regional terrorist movements from merging with similar groups, thereby creating an immediate threat to the security of NATO Allies, some of which are already taking action to provide an adequate response, including when their links with the continent are more recent than those of the Allies with an established presence;
- c. to strengthen assistance to partner countries of the Mediterranean Dialogue (MD) in the development of adequate counterterrorism strategies that foster interethnic reconciliation and an inclusive political process;
- d. to explore the potential that member countries such as Portugal, Spain, Italy and Greece could offer for reinforcing security in Africa thanks to their privileged geographical position as a bridge between Europe and the African continent;
- e. to explore options for a shared EU-NATO approach on promoting stability in Africa and the MENA region so that both organisations can pursue common objectives, identify necessary means and mutually reinforce the respective efforts of each other;
- f. to further develop NATO's fledgling relationship with African actors, particularly the African Union;
- g. to further develop the Alliance's cooperation with the AU on security- and politics-related topics, such as the operationalisation of the African Standby Forces (ASF) and the promotion of good governance through the expansion of NATO's Building Integrity Programmes;
- h. to consider expanding NATO's Partnership for Peace (PfP) Programme to Sub-Saharan African states interested in formalising their cooperation with the Alliance on political and security-related issues in a manner which complements other missions engaged in stabilisation processes, including the Partnership for Security and Stability in the Sahel.

RESOLUTION 459
on
STRENGTHENING NATO CYBER SECURITY
DEFENCE, AND DETERRENCE⁷

The Assembly,

1. **Recognising** the increasingly complex international cyber threat landscape;
2. **Increasingly facing** persistent cyber campaigns falling below the threshold of armed conflict and **acknowledging** an important role for the Alliance in countering them;
3. **Remaining vigilant** regarding increasing cyber threats from terrorist and extremist groups;
4. **Underlining** that cyber attacks by states or their proxies present the biggest cyber threat to NATO;
5. **Stressing** that cyber attacks can threaten national and Euro-Atlantic prosperity, security, and stability and could, thus, lead to the invocation of the collective defence clause (Article 5) of the NATO's founding treaty;
6. **Underscoring** that Allies have an individual responsibility to maintain and develop both individual and collective capacity to resist cyber attacks, but **highlighting** NATO's crucial support role;
7. **Emphasising** NATO's defensive mandate, its continued adherence to international law, and the principle of strong political oversight of military operations;
8. **Recalling** the need to operate and defend in cyber space as effectively as in other military domains;
9. **Lauding** recent Allied and NATO progress on strengthening cyber security, defence, and deterrence;
10. **Recalling** the difficulty of attributing cyber attacks and **stressing** the danger of escalation and the need for states to decide on appropriate responses;
11. **URGES** member governments and parliaments of the North Atlantic Alliance:
 - a. to fulfil their national cyber commitments under the NATO Defence Planning Process and the NATO Cyber Defence Pledge;
 - b. to adopt a NATO cyber space doctrine by the end of 2019;

Cyber Security and Defence

- c. to redouble their efforts on:
 - i. cyber capability development;
 - ii. cyber defence expenditures;
 - iii. adaptation of Allied and NATO structures;

⁷ presented by the Science and Technology Committee and adopted by the Plenary Assembly on Monday 14 October 2019, London, United Kingdom.

- iv. integration of cyber effects into military operations;
 - v. refinement of cyber strategies and policies at the national and NATO levels;
 - vi. cooperation and exchange of best practices;
 - vii. situational awareness, information sharing, and assessment;
 - viii. enhancement of skills and awareness across all national and NATO stakeholder communities;
 - ix. fostering education, training and exercises;
 - x. strengthening effective cyber partnerships with industry, academia, partner nations, and other international organisations, especially the EU as part of the NATO-EU Strategic Partnership;
- d. to strongly consider making defensive and offensive cyber effects available for NATO operations on a voluntary basis, if not already committed to do so;

Cyber Deterrence

- e. to continue to signal their resolve and credibility to deter cyber attacks;
- f. to maintain a cyber deterrence policy of ambiguity concerning the threshold at which a cyber attack is considered an armed attack and possible collective responses if that threshold is crossed;
- g. to continue to seek to reduce escalatory risks through clear diplomatic messaging and engagement, a high level of transparency on cyber capabilities and policies, and support to normdevelopment and confidence-building measures in cyber space;

Persistent Cyber Campaigns

- h. to recognise the long-term strategic risk constituted by persistent cyber campaigns and intensify consultations within the Alliance and with partners with membership aspirations;
 - i. to counter persistent cyber campaigns with the right mix of security, defence, and deterrence, including increased civil preparedness and resilience;
 - j. to attribute malicious cyber operations, when feasible, in a timely and coordinated fashion while respecting the sovereignty of governments; and
 - k. to continue to refine their strategies for countering hybrid threats.
-

Appendix:

The NATO Parliamentary Assembly

The Assembly's role

Since its creation in 1955, the NATO Parliamentary Assembly has brought together members of parliament from all Allied nations. The Assembly serves as a unique parliamentary forum to discuss and influence decisions on Alliance security.

The Assembly – made up of representatives of national parliaments – is institutionally separate from NATO, where decisions are made by representatives of national governments. As such, the Assembly's views are not legally binding for NATO or its governments. However, the NATO PA serves as an essential link between NATO and the parliaments of its member nations, and it thus maintains a constructive and active dialogue and cooperation with NATO.

The NATO PA:

- Facilitates parliamentary awareness and understanding of the key issues affecting the security of the Euro-Atlantic area;
- Supports national parliamentary oversight of defence and security;
- Helps strengthen the transatlantic relationship;
- Promotes the values underpinning the Alliance;
- Provides greater transparency to NATO policies; and
- Fosters better understanding of the Alliance's objectives and missions among legislators and citizens of the Alliance.

The Assembly brings together 266 members of parliament from the 29 NATO national parliaments. Each delegation's size is relative to its country's population, and each delegation must reflect the political composition of its parliament. The Assembly's membership, therefore, represents a broad spectrum of political opinion within the Alliance.

Partnerships with lawmakers from countries seeking a closer association with NATO are an essential dimension of the Assembly's work. Even before the Cold War ended, the Assembly reached out to members of parliaments of the Warsaw Pact, and today the Assembly's partnerships are wide and deep. The NATO PA welcomes delegates from 12 associate countries and four Mediterranean associate countries. Observers from eight other parliaments take part in its activities. Thus, the Assembly complements and reinforces NATO's own programme of partnership and cooperation.

Other parliamentary delegations are invited on an ad hoc basis. These notably include delegations from Afghanistan, Iraq, and the Parliamentary Assembly of the Mediterranean.

The NATO PA's structure

The Assembly's governing body is the Standing Committee. It performs a wide range of political, administrative, and financial tasks; it also coordinates the overall work of the Assembly. It is composed of the Head of each member delegation, the President, the Vice-Presidents, the Treasurer, the Secretary General, and the Chairpersons of all the Committees.

The President is elected by his/her peers to represent the Assembly and act as its leading political officer. The five Vice-Presidents, the President, and the Treasurer collectively form the Assembly's Bureau. The Bureau's main function is to ensure the overall guidance and coherence of the Assembly's policies and activities in the interval between meetings of the Standing Committee. It also acts as the "first responder" when internal or external events require a decision or a statement by the Assembly.

Five Committees (including their eight Sub-Committees) are charged with examining the security and policy challenges confronting Allied countries and are responsible for most of the Assembly's substantive work:

- the Committee on the Civil Dimension of Security
- the Defence and Security Committee
- the Economics and Security Committee
- the Political Committee
- the Science and Technology Committee

Other Assembly bodies include:

- the Mediterranean and Middle East Special Group
- the Ukraine-NATO Inter-parliamentary Council
- the Georgia-NATO Inter-parliamentary Council

A NATO-Russia Parliamentary Committee was discontinued in April 2014 following Russia's military intervention in Ukraine and its decision to annex the Ukrainian province of Crimea in March 2014.

The International Secretariat, under its Secretary General, is responsible for the bulk of research and analysis that supports the Assembly's Committees, Sub-Committees and other groups, as well as all the practical and administrative arrangements for all its activities and meetings.

How the Assembly works

The Assembly organises some 40 activities every year, bringing together between ten and 350 members of parliament in various formats.

The Committees and Sub-Committees meet several times during the year and organise visits to both NATO and non-NATO countries. In these meetings, they receive briefings from leading government and parliamentary representatives as well as senior academics and experts.

Two particularly large-scale meetings are organised each year: the Spring and Annual Sessions. During the Spring Session, elected Committee and Sub-Committee rapporteurs present draft reports for a first discussion. The reports are then revised and updated for further discussion, amendment, and are adopted at the Annual Session in the autumn.

At the Annual Session, the Committees also produce policy recommendations. Once adopted in the plenary sitting, these are forwarded to the NATO Secretary General and to national governments and parliaments. Although these policy recommendations are not binding, NATO's Secretary General provides a written reaction to them, and they are widely seen as important indications of political sentiment on key topics within the Alliance.

Other NATO PA's activities:

- The **Rose-Roth Programme** is an outreach effort to assist partner countries in the EuroAtlantic region, mainly in the Balkans and the South Caucasus, as they continue to face challenging transition processes. Particular attention is paid to promoting the principles of democratic control of armed forces and to the development of effective parliamentary oversight of the defence and security sector.
- The **NATO Orientation Programme** is focused primarily on young or newly elected members of parliament from NATO and partner nations, as well as those newly assigned to security or foreign affairs responsibilities. The programme aims at providing an in-depth overview of NATO and its evolving partnerships.
- The **Parliamentary Transatlantic Forum** in Washington, D.C., aims to provide an annual discussion of issues which are central to the transatlantic relationship and to explore a broad range of international security issues with leading members of the Washingtonbased policy community.
- The **President** and the **Bureau** regularly represent the Assembly at external events and conferences. They can also organise separate high-level visits as a way to signal the Assembly's particular interest in a specific topic or location, or in response to significant international events which call for a quick Assembly reaction.

Financing

The Assembly is directly funded by member parliaments and governments and is financially and administratively separate from NATO itself.

Membership of the Assembly

Member Delegations

Member states	Delegates
United States	36
France	18
Germany	18
Italy	18
Turkey	18
United Kingdom	18
Canada	12
Poland	12
Spain	12
Romania	10
Belgium	7
Czech Republic	7
Greece	7
Hungary	7
Netherlands	7
Portugal	7
Bulgaria	6
Denmark	5
Norway	5
Slovakia	5
Croatia	5
Lithuania	4
Albania	4
Estonia	3
Iceland	3
Latvia	3
Luxembourg	3
Montenegro	3
Slovenia	3
29	266

Associate Delegations

Ukraine	8
Austria	5
Azerbaijan	5
Serbia	5
Sweden	5
Switzerland	5
Finland	4
Georgia	4
Armenia	3
Bosnia and Herzegovina	3
Republic of Moldova	3
Republic of North Macedonia	3
12	53

European Parliament Delegation

	10
--	-----------

Regional Partner and Mediterranean Associate Member Delegations

Algeria	3
Morocco	3
Israel	3
Jordan	3
4	12

Parliamentary Observer Delegations

Assembly of Kosovo	2
Australia	2
Egypt	2
Japan	2
Kazakhstan	2
Palestinian National Council	2
Tunisia	2
Republic of Korea	2
8	16

Inter-parliamentary Assembly Delegations

OSCE PA	2
PACE	2
2	4

Committees, Sub-Committees and Working Groups

Committee on the Civil Dimension of Security (CDS)

Sub-Committee on Democratic Governance (CDSDG)

Defence and Security Committee (DSC)

Sub-Committee on Future Security and Defence Capabilities (DSCFC)

Sub-Committee on Transatlantic Defence and Security Cooperation (DSCTC)

Economics and Security Committee (ESC)

Sub-Committee on Transition and Development (ESCTD)

Sub-Committee on Transatlantic Economic Relations (ESCTER)

Political Committee (PC)

Sub-Committee on NATO Partnerships (PCNP)

Sub-Committee on Transatlantic Relations (PCTR)

Science and Technology Committee (STC)

Sub-Committee on Technology Trends and Security (STCTTS)

Mediterranean and Middle East Special Group (GSM)

Ukraine-NATO Interparliamentary Council (UNIC)

Georgia-NATO Interparliamentary Council (GNIC)

NATO-Russia Parliamentary Committee (NRPC)

(Discontinued as of April 2014)

Members of the Bureau of the Assembly

President

Attila MESTERHAZY (Hungary)

Vice-Presidents

Osman Askin BAK (Turkey)

Philippe FOLLIOU (France), acting

Michael R. TURNER (United States)

Karl A. LAMERS (Germany)

Treasurer

Osman Askin BAK (Turkey), acting until 31st March 2020

Wolfgang HELLMICH (Germany) – Incoming on 1 st April 2020

Secretary General

Ruxandra POPA (France)



NATO Parliamentary Assembly

3 Place du Petit Sablon | B-1000 Brussels

Tel: +32(0)25132865 | Fax: +32(0)25141847 E-mail: press@nato-pa.int

Web site: www.nato-pa.int



NATO PARLIAMENTARY ASSEMBLY
ASSEMBLEE PARLEMENTAIRE DE L'OTAN

DCAF Geneva Centre
for Security Sector
Governance